The Dunbarton Board of Selectmen held a scheduled Public Hearing for the request from David Nault for a layout of Kelsea Road at the above time, date and place with Brian Pike, Chairman, presiding.

The following were present:

- Brian Pike, Chairman
- Tom Groleau, Selectman
- Line Comeau, Town Administrator
- Alison Vallieres, Recording Secretary

Attendees:

- David Nault
- Michael Dalberg, Surveyor for David Nault
- Michael Guiney
- Edward L. Rogers, PE, LLS for Michael Guiney
- Tim Guiney
- Mike Guiney
- John Guiney
- Gary Chicoine
- Joshua Nault
- Leigh Nault
- Dan Sklut, Police Chief
- Greg Belanger
- Steve Blats
- Jeff Crosby, Road Agent

Brian Pike, Chairman, called the Public Hearing to order at 7:00 p.m. He stated that the Dunbarton Board of Selectmen received the Petition from David Nault to "Layout a highway in said town described as Kelsea Road, per RSA 231:8" on September 3, 2015. He announced that the meeting was being taped. Written minutes will be the official record of the meeting. He requested that David Nault lay out the merits of his request for the layout of Kelsea Road.

Brian Pike, Chairman, read the Public Notice for the Public Hearing. He stated the Board of Selectmen was here to hear the merits of the request and if it is in the public interest to grant the petition.

At this point in the meeting, David Nault presented his reasons for the petition for the "Layout of Kelsea Road" as follows:

David Nault stated for the record that he petitioned for the layout of Kelsea Road five times over the last two years to have some sort of layout of Kelsea Road because there have been obstacles put on Kelsea Road. They were using the road as a turn around and maintaining the road for many years because there has been no action at the Selectmen's level. Stated he wanted to state that for the record. Stated he was asking them to layout a section of Kelsea Road for the Town and the rest of the abutters beyond Mike Guiney's property.
David Nault presented the following documents:

1. **Property Tax Map** in its present condition without the Right of Way. It shows the road going past Mike Guiney’s house.

2. **Survey Plan by John Hills Company** showing the Gildersleeve property showing the approximate location of Kelsea Road on this map. The house is on one side and the barn is on the other side and was the approximate location of Kelsea Road. The RSA’s say to show old maps, etc.

3. **USGS Map of the Town of Dunbarton 1925/1945**. Mike Guiney’s house is on the corner. Shows on Black Brook Road and the old cellar hole on my land. Surveyed in 1925 and revised in 1945. Kelsea Road comes down and is the same width road on the way to the brook where my house (David Nault) house is today. Goes down to the second homestead on the left.

4. **USGS DOT map by Henry Monroe 1925-41**. Different corner showing the same as the previous map. First map that you have seen that goes by Mike Guiney's house on the way to the brook.

5. **Sub-Division Plan of Kelsea Road (Lloyd/Brown) - Plan #2642** Shows Kelsea Road going to my property in 1971. Marked Wheeler Road and Bernatas Road at one time.

6. **1941 Dunbarton Property Map** shows Kelsea Road coming down in the same location. Kelsea Road comes right to my land.

7. **Dalberg Certified Plot Plan , 9/9/2010** - Old foundations in place and shows where his house is located and old rock foundations. Old bridge abutment where the road passes over the brook. Shows where the old foundations were on site. Had Mike Dalberg document them before we built on them. We have pictures also. There is a stone causeway 4’ - 5’ high.

8. **Dalberg Certified Plot Plan dated 8/31/2006** showing Kelsea Road at the location and the right of way where it abuts. Research and maps that have been done around the area. Three rod road per Town record. Northerly and then northeast.

At this point, Brian Pike noted that Goffstown is easterly.

9. **1925-49 revised USGS Map** - This is the same map as previously presented. Shows light duty road. It doesn’t show a dotted line.

10. **1941 - Board of Selectmen Property Map**. Showing Kelsea Road before the split. Kelsea Road is going right to my land.

11. **Early Landmarks and Highway Map of 1821**. Shows Kelsea Road coming around and goes straight towards my land.

At this point in the Public Hearing, Brian Pike, Chairman, read the Town Record Description of Kelsea Road as follows:

"Dunbarton May 29 - 1821  (As recorded in Town Records, Dunbarton, NH from 1800 to 1824, Vol 2, page 511)

"We the subscribers Selectmen for the Town of Dunbarton have this day laid out a highway three rods wide from Goffstown line nearly north to Timothy Johnson house & from thence nearly north east nearly on a straight line to the County road, said road is to be a bridle road from said County road to Mr. Johnson house for three years and from Mr. Johnson house to Goffstown line said road is to be a bridle road for the term of six years. Timothy Johnson is to have the rangeway on the west end of his lot in compensation for said road -"
David Nault stated that when there is a dispute, you have to use things in the field and it allows old subdivisions and maps to provide the information to you. That is what the RSA says to do.

12. Bernatas Road Easement Plan.

13. Original map of the Gildersleeve property found at the Archives. Rudolph Belliveau is my grandfather. This shows the approximate location of the road 6/23/1981. This is the approximate location of Kelsea Road coming between the barn and the house.

David Nault stated that old farms and barns were on both sides of the road. It was done for a lot of reasons. This was very common.

14. Aerial Mosaic Map 1941. Same as map on wall in Board of Selectmen's Office. Shows roads. In blue from Archives.

15. Easement Plan by Dalberg showing Kelsea Road 8/27/2008. Stated he wanted to document the old foundations that these maps show.

At this point in the Public Hearing, Brian Pike asked David Nault if he were going to show them anything new. We are seeing a lot of the same maps.

16. Surveyor's Report from Dalberg. Shows a list of some of the same maps. Shows how all those roads were accessed through Kelsea Road.

17. Old Blister Rust Maps showing causeway coming across property.

18. Guiney V. Nault, No. 06-E-0445, 8/2/2007 - Witness and Exhibit Lists

19. Wetlands Survey of the property also shows two old foundations in place.

Brian Pike noted that it has been established that the two foundations are in place.

20. Rogers Engineering - Same map with overlay. Shown in 1969 shows Kelsea Road coming down to Nault property.

21. USGS Map 1927 - Comes down to the second house past Guiney’s house.

22. USGS Map 1949 - Same thing.

23. Copy of the Witness and Exhibit Lists from the Michael J. Guiney v. David A. Nault No. 06-E-0445 Superior Court Case. (Attached) Include Blister Rust Maps on the back. Exhibits are labeled and lettered.

   a. 1858 Map showing new road going to the south
   b. 1892 F. Martin property on Kelsea Road
   c. Topo Map (from a K. Atlas map)
   d. Full size 1941 Tax Map
   e. USGS Maps - shows road going between the house and the barn
   f. PSNH Map - Shows powerlines.


25. Pictures showing causeway.
26. Where the Winds Blow Free. Page 167, 130. Kelsea Place. Built by Timothy Johnson in early days. It is probable the house was built before the highway was laid out which accounts for its being so far from the road. It probably was built on a range-way...The old barn still stands a a newer house built nearby, lately owned by Mrs. Joseph Bernatas. 131. Alonzo Richards house. A road was built across the brook and a small house and barn built by Alonzo Richards for a summer place. ....... Owned in 1927 by Joseph Bernatas, the building no longer is standing......

27. Noted that the Town has maintained this road for many years. Proof is there are four Road Agents still living within this Town. (Simon Audet, Jan VandeBogart, and Jeff Crosby are still living in town) Spoke with Simon Audet but he was unable to attend this meeting because he is 77 years old and goes to bed at 6:00 p.m. Simon Audet did state that he rode with his father, Armand Audet, Road Agent, since he was 17 and they turned around there for 25 years. This shows continued use. We not only have the right to use that portion of Kelsea Road but that portion of Kelsea Road has become a town road because we have maintained it for between 77 and 80 years. Simon Audet knows that we have maintained it.

28. Letter from Skip Trudeau 11/9/2015 - Also spoke with Skip Trudeau and he did the plowing for Simon Audet, Road Agent, and he has written a letter stating he plowed Kelsea Road for 35 years and when no one was home, he also plowed the driveway if no cars were in the way

At this point in the Public Hearing, Brian Pike, Chairman, noted that the Skip Trudeau's signature was not notarized and therefore he felt it would not suffice as accurate evidence. Also Simon Audet was not present at this meeting.

29. RSA 229 relating to Private Roads Layout of Public Highways, etc. - Stated he highlighted key notes from RSA 229:1 as follows: Read them to the Board of Selectmen.

5. ---Private roads, establishment under statutory authority

_Laying out of public highway in manner prescribed by statute is not limited to creation of new road but includes also making into public highway private roads already in existence._

7. ---Presumption, establishment under statutory authority

_Where a right of way has been used continuously by the public under a claim of right for a period of 20 years, a conclusive presumption arises that the right of way had at some previous time been established pursuant to law by the property authority._

_Where a right of way had been used by the public under a claim of right for more than 20 years prior to defendant's acquisition of title, and was a well-defined road, and was used for teaming and hauling wood and lumber and in connection with brick yard and a blacksmith shop, the right of way could properly be described as a 'public way' though never laid out._

10. Establishment by prescription -- In general

_Statute which defines highways to include road used for public travel for twenty years prior to January 1, 1968, does not require evidence of use from January 1, 1968, does not require evidence of use from January 1, 1948, through January 1, 1968: legislature added the language 'prior to January 1, 1968'' to allow any roads already acquired by prescription to stand, but restricted any further establishment......

_The attempts of owner of land to bar use of right of way after town and public had acquired right of way by use thereof for more than 20 years prior thereto, were unavailing, and fact that owner put up bars part of the time did not affect the right of the public and the town._

18. ---- Extent of right acquired, establishment by prescription
The public right to a road used by landowners for access to their farms is not considered lost by abandonment so long as the road has been kept open and the public never excluded therefrom.

19. --- Evidence, establishment by prescription

After a town has acquiesced for more than 20 years in the doings of their selectmen in laying out a highway, they are estopped from saying that the road was not legally laid out.

21. ---- Evidence, establishment by prescription

Ancient maps and deeds supported conclusions that road was used by public beginning in 1814, the use was adverse for a continuous uninterrupted period of twenty years prior to January 1, 1968, and road was class VI highway by prescription, even if an 1896 deed created an easement.

RSA 231:92

9. Turnouts

If a town permits a turnout to exist from the traveled part of its highway to a private way, over adjoining land, with all the characteristic marks of a highway, it will be bound to keep such part of the turnout as is within the laid-out limits of the highway in suitable repair for the travel usually passing over it.

30. A Hard Road to Travel - Made references to various items within this Handbook as follows:

Page 34 - The 'Definition' of Highways - ..............the only proof of highway status today may be its historic actual use under the doctrine of prescription...

Page 38 - Prescription..... the legal theory of prescription--actual use for travel for at least 20 years prior to 1968. RSA 229:1.

Page 38 - ASSEMBLE A RECORD FOR EACH ROAD..... January 1, 1948.... evidence of prescription.

Page 39 - Uninterrupted Use. if the owner's attempts to interrupt the use don't occur until after the 20-year period, that's too late to prevent the creation of a highway because an owner cannot acquire any adverse rights against the public once highway status has legally been established.

Page 39 - Adversity. .....But the public's use must be open and obvious enough that the owner ought to have known a claim of right existed. (property owners' assertion of claim that prior owners treated the road as private during 1800s actually supported town's position that continuous public use during that time was adverse)

Page 39 - WHAT COUNTS AS EVIDENCE OF PUBLIC USE? ....photographs and the testimony of lifelong residents of a community

Page 41 - Today the layout laws are mainly invoked if there is a dispute and somebody wants to reserve the right to appeal the town's decision to court, or there is a desire to use the betterment assessment option.

Page 41 - PETITION REQUIRED .... in order to appeal a person must be "aggrieved."....... RSA 231:8 doesn't provide any detail about what information a layout petition must contain, although many 19th-century cases discussed that issue.
Page 42 - DENIAL WITHOUT NOTICE OR HEARING? ...Also, the New Hampshire Supreme Court has held that when local decisions will affect property values, the owners are constitutionally entitled to some kind of notice and hearing...

Page 50 - laid out at three rods wide..... whole space between the fences to be a public highway. and avoiding obstructions by snow....... Where there are fences or (stone) walls on opposite sides of the wrought road,..... a varying distance between them is not alone enough to destroy their evidentiary value in properly locating the lines. A highway laid out with a width of three rods may have a greater width in such part of its course where more than three rods have in fact been taken for use for highway purposes for the period of prescription

Page 50 - ROAD BOUNDARY DISPUTES: REESTABLISHMENT OF LINES......The selectmen are given authority by RSA 231:27 to "reestablish the boundary lines" of any local highway "which shall have become lost, uncertain, or doubtful"....

Page 51 - ... The statue hasn’t been cited in any New Hampshire Supreme Court case, but the Town of Stark used it successfully in reestablishing boundary lines of a road created by prescription in a case where the abutter had attempted to erect stout poles at the edge of the traveled way.

Page 51 -- Creating Local Road Files: Sources of Information....... Any survey or subdivision plats of land fronting that road..... Copies of any governing body votes establishing regulations on that road, including weight limits, stop signs, no parking zones, etc.

Page 63 The Law Favoring Highway Continuance.... A well-established principle of law is that public highways should be preserved; once public rights of way are established, the rights of the public should last indefinitely, unless a formal public decision is made to discontinue them.....

Page 64 - HIGHWAYS CANNOT BE LOST BY ADVERSE POSSESSION...... The Court held that once a road had been established by 20 years public use (by prescription), its status was not changed by the fact that an abutting property owner subsequently barricaded it for more than 20 years......

Page 64 -- THE PRESUMPTION AGAINST DISCONTINUANCE......the Court wrote, "Highway discontinuance is not favored in the law....and the burden is upon the party who asserts discontinuance to prove it by clear and satisfactory evidence."

Page 111 -- ABUTTERS' RIGHT OF CONTINUED ACCESS TO HIGHWAY..... An abutter's highway access is considered a property right. While it is subject to regulation, it cannot be entirely taken away without compensation.....

Page 113 - Potential for Acceptance. Public maintenance of a road could arguably be construed by a court as an acceptance of the highway, resulting in the town's perpetual responsibility.

David Nault stated that Mike Guiney knew the location of Kelsea Road when he bought his house. The town was plowing the road, maintaining it and turning around on the property.

Brian Pike noted that most of this information re the Road Agents "holds no water". It is not a deposition. There is no proof of their saying this, etc. Noted he felt it would cost a lot to bring this road to a Class V road.

David Nault stated he is only requesting that a portion of Kelsea Road be brought up to Class V. It is a three rod Class V road already. I only asked for a layout of a portion. I am not asking anyone to upgrade the road.
Jeff Crosby, Road Agent, noted that the standard for a Class V road for Subdivisions is 24' wide and paved. We do not have to pave a Class V road. Why would you bring it up to 24' if the rest of the road is 12' wide?

David Nault stated that he also plowed Kelsea Road with Steve Langley. The town has turned around there. I don’t want any additional expense to be spent on that road. As a citizen, I am here telling you that. I just want it to be maintained as it has been and not have the posts in the way so the plow truck can turn around.

Gary Chicoine stated that it is the town’s obligation to maintain that road.

Jeff Crosby, Road Agent, stated that a Class V road does not necessarily mean paving. We have been maintaining it at the level it is now. We have been plowing it. As far as the cost of maintaining:

Dunbarton has 150 miles of road at a cost of $3,333/mile or $.65/foot to plow a road. It would cost about $100 to plow and sand the road whether anyone agrees with it or not. I do know that for ten years, we turned around at Guiney’s barn. Simon Audet turned around down in front of the barn. I am taking him at his word. I go to Simon often regarding history stuff. That is where we turned around. As far as the maintenance, it is not going to be any more of a burden. We have graded it maybe two or three times a year. It is not like it is thousands of dollars. As far as a big cost, I don’t see a big cost. The stake in the ground has nothing to do with Kelsea Road. It is only a stake I put in to mark the approximate location of the proposed turn around.

David Nault stated the reason he was reading the law and highlighting it through prescription is because the Town has been using it. The Town already has a prescription easement. If someone were to stop using a road, it is their burden to show use. The town does have a right to turn around. For the last 90 years, we have been going down Kelsea Road.......I know I have been in front of you before. It is not fair to Jeff or anyone to maintain the road with the posts in the way.

Jeff Crosby noted that the Town cannot turn around in 50’.

At this point in the meeting, Brian Pike, Chairman, asked for a copy of David Nault’s original Petition to layout Kelsea Road.

At this point, Brian Pike, Chairman, stated he would like to declare a recess at 8:30 p.m. to make a telephone call to the Town Attorney. At the same time, the original Petition from David Nault would be located.

The Public Hearing resumed at 8:46 p.m.

At this point, Brian Pike stated that there were three ways to create a Town Road as follows:

1. Acceptance at Town Meeting
2. Layout per RSA 231:8
3. Prescription

Brian Pike, Chairman, stated the Selectmen have no authority to declare the road by Prescription. It has to be done by a Judge. We cannot act on it. We have no legal authority. You have to describe your petition as to why we should layout this road or by prescription which only a judge can do.

David Nault stated the RSA’s say you have the authority to layout a road.

Brian Pike asked David Nault if he had anything else to say regarding the merits.

Jeff Crosby, Road Agent, stated all he wants to do is turn around at Kelsea Road.
Abutters were read as follows:

**Pointer Fish and Game Club Inc.** - Present. Greg Belanger representing Pointer Fish and Game Club. Stated the club was the abutter to the south. Made reference to the map from the end of Kelsea Road. That heads towards our property. That is the map that was recorded by Ed Rogers at the Registry of Deeds.

**Mike Guiney** - Present. If Kelsea Road continues into Mr. Nault’s property then there would have been no reason for a cartway. It would have been a public right of way.

**Mr. and Mrs. Joshua Nault** - Present. Asked if someone hits one of the posts in the traveled portion of the road, who will assume the liability?

Brian Pike noted this would be a civil matter between the parties involved. It would not be the Town.

**Joshua Nault** asked where the Town turnaround is located.

Brian Pike noted there is not one at this time.

**Joshua Nault** noted if it is a Town road then they should be able to go to my house. There should be a turn around.

**Sean Rothe** - Not Present

**Gary Chicoine** - Present. Asked if you have to get a permit to put posts up for a fence? You are not supposed to place anything in the Right of Way. You have been put on notice. I consider it a public road. You are going to be liable. You do not have a turnaround if it snows tomorrow. How are you going to turn around? What are you going to do with the snow?

Brian Pike stated we will do our best.

**Gary Chicoine** stated you can’t fit two fire trucks up the road. If they can't fit, you have done nothing about it. It seems you have been pushing back all night long. I am putting you on notice. You are not doing your job. I also pay taxes. I want you to do your jobs.

**Mr. Spencer & Ms. Elizabeth Nault** - Not Present

**Mike Guiney** -- Present. People are turning around. They generally turn around at the other end of the road. There are "No Trespassing" signs.

**Jeff Crosby** - No comments

**Dan Sklut** - No comments

**Ed Rogers, Surveyor** - Stated he was a Civil Engineer/Licensed Surveyor. Back in June 2007, he prepared a report which listed a lot of references to try to decipher where the right of way was on the subject property. The petitioner has presented many of these references and I was also a little disgusted that he has used my methodology.

The town’s maps in general say nothing about the decision or status. We can see Kelsea Road went from here to where is pretty misleading. To try to determine the width of a road from a USGS map is difficult. What the petitioner has presented you is evidence of a private easement which dates back to 1870 which serves his own property. If it was a public road, he would not have presented it. It is very unfortunate that he has chosen this avenue and forum. What we have here is the petitioner has chosen to take this to the town to try to furnish a resolution. We are dealing with a private easement which was between Mr. Gildersleeve for a private easement between his house and his barn. A private cart road services Mr. Nault's
property. This is a civil matter and he should have called Mr. Guiney when the posts were put in the ground. The use has gone on for a long time. You are correct in consulting Town Counsel on that.

**David Nault** - It is unfortunate that he is looking at the signs on my land. Where there have been so many people thinking they could turn around on my property is the reason for the signs. The only solution that the Town has is to layout the road. There are no other easements or right of ways. My petition is only for the portion of the road that the Town currently maintains.

**Tim Guiney, Hudson** - Asked if the Town could turn around in the green area on the map.

It was noted the Town is currently working out an easement for the turn around.

**Joshua Nault** - Would it be safe to say that the posts should come down and come back to the way they were for 90 years?

It was noted the Selectmen do not have the authority to take them down. It is not a public road at this time.

Brian Pike noted that is why we have a petition to lay it out. It is a private property turn around maintained by the Town. The Town has already taken it to Town Counsel. That is for a court of law. We do not have the authority to layout the road.

**Gary Chicoine** stated he thinks the Town is turning their back on us.

**David Nault** stated that it is the Selectmen's opinion that you still don't have any liability. You will find out when there is a major lawsuit.

Ed Rogers asked if the Board will be making a decision this evening.

Brian Pike, Chairman, stated the Board of Selectmen would be making a decision this evening.

There being no further public comment, Brian Pike, Chairman, closed the Public Hearing at 9:10 p.m.

**Board Discussion:**

Brian Pike, Chairman, stated that Town Counsel had put together an ANALYSIS OF "OCCASION" to use in our deliberations.

David Nault asked for a copy of this document. Brian Pike stated this falls under “Client Attorney Privilege”.

The Board of Selectmen addressed their deliberations as follows:

In assessing the "public interest", the BOS may consider, among other factors:

1. integration within an existing road system;
   
   Tom Groleau stated the answer would be No to the above factor.

2. ease of existing traffic flow;
   
   Selectmen agreed that this would not apply

3. improvement to convenience of travel;
   
   Both Selectmen agreed that the answer to this factor would be No.
(4) facilitation of transportation for school children;

Both Selectmen agreed there are no school children this would apply to.

(5) improved accessibility to business district and employment centers;

Both Selectmen agreed the answer to this factor would be No.

(6) improved accessibility for fire, emergency and police services;

Both Selectmen agreed there would be no improvements to the road and no widening.

(7) whether it would benefit a significant portion or just a small fraction of the town tax base of year-round residents; and

If the Selectmen granted the request, and the town maintains the road, would the Town be able to continue to turn around? It would only be a small fraction of the town tax base. The answer would be no.

(8) anticipated frequency of road use.

Both Selectmen agreed there would be no more frequency of road use then at present.

In addition in assessing the 'town burden', the Board of Selectmen may consider the following:

(1) anticipated cost of construction to bring road up to town standards;

The Selectmen agreed there would be no impact to the above.

(2) cost of ongoing maintenance pertaining to the road itself; and

Both Selectmen agreed there would be no change from the existing ongoing maintenance. The Road Agent needs a place to turn around. Would have to take additional land by eminent domain or fee simple. We need a turnaround more than 50'. It would be a one-time increase.

(3) the impact on the town's infrastructure due to municipal growth, such as increased costs for school, fire, police and emergency systems.

Both Selectmen agreed this would be negligible because residents are already living down there. There is room for one more house down there. The road does not have to be widened. There would be minimal impact on the school.

Brian Pike stated the Board will ask Town Counsel if they can give a copy of the Analysis of Occasion to David Nault. It was noted that the Board of Selectmen's meeting with Town Counsel was an Attorney/Client Privilege and there are no recorded minutes.

MOTION:

Brian Pike made a motion that based on the Petition of David Nault for a layout of Kelsea Road and therefore the evidence presented, there is not enough evidence to grant the petition and thereby the Board of Selectmen denies the request from David Nault for a layout of Kelsea Road. Tom Groleau seconded the motion.

Motion Discussion:
Tom Groleau stated that based on the answers to the questions of the Analysis of "Occasion", it just does not measure up to the requirements. I understand where you are coming from and it is nothing personal. This is the hand you were dealt. The layout procedure is what it is. ... This doesn't meet the purpose of layout of the road. Town Meeting can go either way.

David Nault stated Mike Guiney has also requested a layout of Kelsea Road which is because a previous Selectman did nothing.

David Nault stated he has come to the Selectmen and nothing was done and the only evidence I had was to petition the Selectmen to do something. My petition has come out of case law. Why won't the Town take a proactive stand. You just don't maintain driveways. I am wondering why the Selectmen are not taking a proactive stand because they have been maintaining it for 90 years. You are saying I don't have complete proof. Do you want me to come back to the Board with more evidence?

Vote:

Groleau - Yes
Pike - Yes

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned with the following motion:

MOTION:

Tom Groleau made a motion that the Dunbarton Board of Selectmen adjourn at 9:45 p.m. Brian Pike seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,

Alison R. Vallieres
Recording Secretary

___________________________________
Brian Pike, Chairman

___________________________________
Tom Groleau Selectman